COVID-19 Analysis
KNOWLEDGE / ATTITUDES / PRACTICES / PARTICIPATION

Risk Communication, Community Engagement and Accountability (CEA) recommendations based on an interdisciplinary review of literature related to COVID-19. This includes a scan of literature from the fields of social science, design, futures and other research fields with a focus on literature on Asia Pacific.

To share feedback, or to contribute, email Caroline Austin, IFRC Asia Pacific Community Engagement Team on RRCEA.AP@ifrc.org

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Update #4: 17/06/2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Themes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>#Participation</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Participation; recovery; importance | - This article confirms the longstanding finding of the **critical importance of community participation** in the disaster recovery decision-making in the field of humanitarian aid and development.  
- Participation offers several advantages, **the most important of which may be sustainability**: by involving citizens, recovery can build community capacity to sustain success in the long run. | Olshansky, R. (2005). How do communities recover from disaster? A review of current knowledge and an agenda for future research. 46th Annual Conference of the Association of Collegiate Schools of  |
This Lancet article summaries how to create constructive participation in the context of emergency responses to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Suggested steps in enabling community participation in the COVID-19 response include:

- **Invest in co-production**
  - Fund dedicated staff and spaces to bring the public and policy makers together.
  - Create spaces where people can take part on their own terms (e.g., avoid bureaucratic formalities or technical jargon)
  - Move beyond simply gathering views and instead build dialogue and reflection to genuinely codesign responses.
  - Invest not only for this emergency but also for long-term preparedness.

- **Work with community groups**
  - Build on their expertise and networks.
  - Use their capacity to mobilise their wider communities.

- **Commit to diversity**
  - Capture a broad range of knowledge and experiences.
  - Avoid one-size-fits-all approaches to involvement.
  - Consciously include the most marginalised.

- **Be responsive and transparent**
  - Show people that their concerns and ideas are heard and acted upon.
  - Collaborate to review outcomes on diverse groups and make improvements.

Participation; methods; actors; motivation

- This article outlines strategies to motivate participation in online communities, especially for those internet users who regularly login to online communities, but seldom post.
- It outlines the principle that online, 90% of the participants only read content, 9% of the participants edit content and 1% of the participants actively create new content.
- Strategies to encourage participation in these silent users include:
  - Providing external stimuli, some examples which include financial rewards, book prizes or validation from others;
  - Improved user-friendliness of the online experience to make it easier for users to participate;
  - Encouraging participation which could include a welcome statement, explicit comments direct to the participant, support for browsing and praise from the moderator; and
  - Guidance for newcomers which can include directions from other more experienced members to help newcomers to become familiar with the community as quickly as possible, moderator or members showing enthusiasm of the group and demonstrating that those who are new to the community are treated as welcome.


Participation; methods; actors

- This resource outlines how to support people to participate online and engage participation from people who aren’t online.
- Useful tips include to engage participation include:
  - Turn up where they already are. What online tools is the group already using or familiar with? E.g. even if they don’t want to participate on your preferred platform, they might be meeting elsewhere (i.e. in a Facebook group) and be willing to provide input via that platform.
  - Offer alternatives. Just like in ‘normal times’, not everyone wants to participate in a group/public meeting. Offer other options such as online surveys and submission processes.

MosaicLab - Connecting people online (hard to reach + beyond reach)
- **Provide technical support.** Some people want to take part but need some extra help. Prepare simple guides that step people through the tool or platform, provide 'tech representatives' that can call and 'walk through' the session with participants prior to the day, and have an 'on call' tech person available during every online meeting. Cater to specific needs. Identify any barriers (such as people experiencing language or literacy difficulties or those who identify as having a disability) and work to address them. This might include providing simplified or visual content in multiple formats, content in different languages, an interpreter for your session (yes - they can be part of your online workshop), captioning all your videos, etc.

- **Break it up.** Remember that working online and sitting/staring at a screen can be tiring and you need to break sessions up into smaller blocks. Just as in a good face-to-face session, make sure you don’t talk ‘at’ people for too long!

- **Bring resources to them** (or bring them to the resources) If your budget allows (or if you have these items on hand), you can provide people with access to devices, data and an internet connection. You can also offer a place for them to sit at an office or location that already has this all available (maintaining correct social distances of course!).

**Participation; methods; actors**

- This article is a case study on disaster recovery following the Christchurch earthquakes in 2010 and 2011.
- This case study demonstrates how participation following a disaster should take place in **formal settings and also through informal channels and forums** to be successful.
  - It outlines the importance of fostering 'a diverse landscape of avenues to engage with disaster recovery' thereby providing **alternative pathways for participation that facilitate connection, ownership and engagement**.
  - It offers three broad categories of channels and forums that are applicable to engage or partner with:

Cretney, R. (2018). Beyond public meetings: Diverse forms of community led recovery following disaster. *International Journal of*
- **Locally Based Neighbourhood Social Support** (supporting neighbours, participating in school, sports and faith groups, holding gatherings)
- **Pre-existing NGO's** [non-government organisations] and Social Service Organisations (Pre-existing community gardens and currencies, Social Service providers such as the Council for Social Services, Environmental and Social Justice Organisations)
- **Grassroots Organisations and Projects** (Public Art and Performances, Urban Agriculture, Transitional Architecture, Democracy and Participation Projects)

- This suggests that the critical importance of fostering and enabling participatory approaches in *informal and formal ways through partnership or engagement with various actors and avenues* in our work can lead to connection, ownership and engagement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation; methods; measurement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- This systematic literature review outlines research findings about online community participation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- It shows that commonly employed metrics are the volume of contributions and the quality of relationships among members. This is based on the assumption that the larger the volume of messages posted, and the closer members feel to each other, the more successful the online community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- However, the article outlines that this does not adequately describe user participation and suggests that the <strong>quality of participation and particularly, the influence of participation for community</strong> is a more successful measurement of participation in online spaces.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Participation; methods; tools | This resource from the International Association for Public Participation, which is one of the largest international organizations advancing the practice of public participation, outlines some adaptive engagement ideas and tools for small and large group settings online and in face to face settings.  
- This resource **focuses on engagement and participation approaches**, as well as, **technology tools** such as Ethelo (deliberation); Synthetron (deliberation); Trello (ideas generation); Poll Everywhere (polling); Slido (polling and Q&A). | Adaptive Engagement Tool Ideas, IAPP, 2020 |
| Participation; methods; tools | This blog post summaries some ideas for using games to inspire participation in engagement opportunities.  
- This suggests that using the format of a game can involve the community in the decision making process in different and innovative ways. | Gamification in Community Engagement, Coulson, 2014 |
### Update #3: 03/06/2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Key Learnings</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Stigma, HIV, SARS | - This article shows that both the fear of people who are different and the fear of disease can lead to stigmatization and may play out as stigma or scapegoating as an epidemic or pandemic emerges.  
- This suggests the importance of understanding in programme response:  
  - how different social groups are characterised and the historical context to these groups; and  
  - Identifying and monitoring power dynamics between social groups that may lead to stigmatisation. |                                                                                                                                                           |
| COVID-19, stigma, HIV | - This article outlines that the convergence of framing COVID-19 as a “foreign virus” and an “infodemic” has ignited fear and stigma.  
- It reports that stigma experiences are shaped by intersecting social identities such as gender and age. Understanding the specific contexts of COVID-19 stigma can inform tailored mitigation strategies. | Logie, C. (2020). Lessons learned from HIV can inform our approach to COVID-19 stigma. Journal                                                                 |
Finally, it provides examples of stigma interventions used in addressing HIV stigma that exposed and eliminated racism and xenophobia experienced by persons blamed for HIV. These include:

- Initiatives that encourage **sharing on how stigma affects communities** and **encouraging reflection on personal biases** and ensuring institutional support for stigma mitigation.
- Participatory learning through **engagement activities that use approaches such as discussions, games and role-play**.

| COVID-19, coronavirus, Twitter, stigma, social media, public health | - This study investigates how referencing COVID-19 as the “Chinese virus” or “China virus” has the potential to create and perpetuate stigma, especially online.  
- It finds that the rise in tweets referencing “Chinese virus” or “China virus,” along with the content of these tweets from March 2020, **indicates that knowledge translation, including information generation, filtering, and amplification, may be occurring online and COVID-19 stigma is likely being perpetrated on Twitter in some contexts.**  
- This suggests that the language used is important. Attaching locations or ethnicity to the COVID-19 virus may perpetuate existing negative stereotypes and assumptions and fuel stigmatizing attitudes. |

---


[https://doi.org/10.2196/19301](https://doi.org/10.2196/19301)
| COVID-19, stigma, HIV | - This guide suggests that the use of inclusive language and less stigmatizing terminology helped to control stigma related to HIV.  
- It demonstrates that words matter and **considering the use of appropriate language has the power to strengthen the response to epidemics, as language shapes beliefs and may influence behaviours.** | **UNAIDS Terminology Guidelines, October 2011** |
| COVID-19, stigma, humanitarian settings. | - This article outlines lessons learned from previous epidemics that are applicable to COVID-19.  
- These include:  
  - that stigmatizing viral transmission further places populations at risk and reduces access to care because this drives people to hide illness to avoid discrimination and prevent them from seeking health care or adopting preventative practices. | **Lau, L.S., Samari, G., Moresky, R.T. et al. COVID-19 in humanitarian settings and lessons learned from past epidemics. Nat Med 26, 647–648 (2020).**  
https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-020-0851-2 |
| COVID-19, stigma, HIV | - This article outlines how historical and current approaches to illness—including HIV—can inform COVID-19 stigma reduction. Approaches suggested include:  
  - Stigma-reduction information should carefully **reflect the evolving patterns of COVID-19 risk to foster empathy** while simultaneously transforming physical distancing into a normal and sustained practice until the pandemic is over; and  
  - Empowering and strengthening communities to support persons to protect their own and one other’s health; and | **Logie CH, Turan JM. How Do We Balance Tensions Between COVID-19 Public Health Responses and** |
- Stigma interventions should address both factors which cause stigma (knowledge, misinformation) and facilitators (health policies, institutional practices) to be effective.
# RELIGION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Key Learnings</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications | - This article illustrates that previous health crises such as HIV and AIDS were not just health crises, but had social and moral elements such as uncertainty, fear and blame as well.  
- Given these social and moral elements, this article outlines that religious leaders can be powerful agents of change, with their enormous influence in reducing stigma and discrimination. | HEALTH-ASIA: Religious Leaders Tackle HIV, AIDS. Jaime.IPS - Inter Press Service; Montevideo, Jan 2008. |
| COVID-19; mass gatherings; religion | - This article outlines that mass gathering management and cancellations require clear communication and responsive political approaches.  
- Decisions to cancel mass religious gatherings are viewed as difficult and unpopular but are made to safeguard not only the mass gathering but also the wider global community.  
- Emphasising the benefits to the wider community is thought to be effective in communicating mass gathering cancellations. | The cancellation of mass gatherings (MGs)? Decision making in the time of COVID-19, Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease. Available online 14 March 2020. |
| Religion; stigma; Ebola | This article outlines the impact of quarantine from previous outbreaks, including the Ebola epidemic in Liberia.  
- For some minority groups the impact of quarantine in the Ebola epidemic led to stigma, which potentially led participants in this study to keep easily treatable, non-Ebola illnesses a secret and avoid seeking help.  
- Therefore, it finds that education about the disease and clear communication on the rationale for quarantine and public health information provided to the general public can be beneficial to reduce stigma. They suggest that more detailed information targeted at schools and workplaces might also be useful. |
|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications | This article sets out how religious beliefs and practices shape (positively and negatively) ways of caring for the sick, patterns of stigma, and gender roles.  
- For example, Ebola’s close association with cultural and religious practices makes active community engagement especially important as change of funeral practices was imperative to reversing the epidemic and religious leaders (modern and traditional, Muslim and Christian) have to be involved.  
- It further illustrates that the religious dimensions of behaviour change, for example on burials, and highlights the value of religious community expertise and the need to draw on it more purposefully and systematically in community engagement. |
| Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications | This article outlines what can be learnt from recent outbreaks to strengthen risk communication capacity for the next influenza pandemic in the Western Pacific Region.  
- A lesson learned from the SARS outbreak in Fiji in 2016 showed that religious leaders, women’s groups and youth networks have a place in effective risk communication in engaging vulnerable groups, particularly pregnant women, encouraging vaccination and adoption of protective behaviours. |


Learning from recent outbreaks to strengthen risk communication capacity for the next influenza pandemic in the
| Behaviour; collective action; collective societies | This article considers how to motivate preventative actions through public health messaging.  
- It considers the benefits of communicating prevention messaging to individuals, society, or both.  
- It finds that putting greater emphasis on self-identity (‘Don’t be a spreader’) inhibit high-risk behaviours related to infection control better than those using less (‘Don’t spread’)  
- Therefore, emphasising the public benefit within public health messaging is more effective in motivating preventative actions. | Warning “Don’t spread” vs. “Don’t be a spreader” to prevent the COVID-19 pandemic, May 2020. |
| Collective action; strong group identity | This rapid, narrative review summarizes useful evidence from behavioural science for fighting the COVID-19 outbreak. It outlines that:  
- Public-spirited behaviour is more likely when a strategy that is “best for all” is clearly articulated and repeated.  
- Stronger group identity - nationally, locally, within organizations - enhances collective action.  
### Update #1: 28/04/2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Key Learnings</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>#SOCIAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3173574.3173788">https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3173574.3173788</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Population perception; social media | - This article uncovers the specific types of risks and multiple dimensions of these risk perceptions of the public. The article also shares the solutions proposed by the public to deal with the risk during the Zika virus crisis on the social media platform Reddit.  
- It demonstrates:  
  - That social media can be utilized in bottom-up efforts to articulate risks and risk management measures.  
  - In health crises of high uncertainty, average citizens rely on themselves to develop plausible explanations about the public health crisis. This highlights the importance of ordinary citizens as risk communicators.  
  - It highlights opportunities of participatory risk communication, where the public can be engaged as risk communicators so that public health authorities can solicit public views, understand public interest and concerns, the rationality and values behind the public’s risk perception, and investigate issues that they may have overlooked (e.g. experiential and local knowledge).  
  - Finally, ordinary citizens think beyond the personal scope of risk. Thus, it is important to address the public’s interest in understanding, identifying, and being informed about risks beyond the personal scope of health messaging. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population perception; quarantine</td>
<td>- This research, published in Lancet, into the psychological impact of quarantine shows that providing a clear rationale in communications for the isolation measures can protect mental health and well being.</td>
<td>The psychological impact of quarantine and how to reduce it: rapid review of the evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognition; health</td>
<td>- This research highlights that recalling complex information can be more difficult during times when resources and attention is stretched thinly therefore it is important to focus on communicating the most important information.</td>
<td>Poverty Impedes Cognitive Function</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Population perception; health              | - People more concerned for those vulnerable to COVID-19 than for their own health, poll shows.  
   - A silver lining: The majority believe pandemic will bring them closer to family and friends.  
   - This highlights it is key to share what the public can do in order to protect the most vulnerable. | IPOS Poll                                                                                       |
| Physical/social distancing                 | - In this new working paper, Flavio Toxvaerd revisits one of the most pressing issues of the day - social distancing.  
   - Taking an economist's perspective to this issue, he asks how and when spontaneous social distancing may be expected to occur and what drives people’s efforts to protect themselves against infection.  
   - This highlights that even without any government intervention or legislation, spontaneous and non-coordinated social distancing will eventually occur. | COVID-19 Economic Research University of Cambridge                                             |
| Accessible channels; risk communications   | - Evidence shows that the public can make informed choices, protect themselves, and comply with recommended practices if they perceive measures of:  
   - Consistency, competence, fairness, objectivity, empathy, or sincerity in crisis response;  
   - communicated through trusted and accessible channels; and                                | Monitoring behavioural insights related to COVID-19 and                                          |
| **Risk communications** | 
|---|---|
| - This Lancet article summarises and publishes outcomes from the Weekly COVID-19 Snapshot Monitoring (COSMO) tool initiated in Germany. | **supplementary material** |
| - It reports that two lines of communication dominated in the media in week 11: (i) the outbreak needs to be slowed down to prevent overburdening of the health system (e.g., #flatteningthecurve on Twitter) and (ii) to protect those who are very vulnerable. | Monitoring behavioural insights related to COVID-19 and supplementary material |
| - The second wave of the survey asked whether participants would be willing to restrict themselves in their everyday lives given these two different explanations (within subject). The analysis showed that in general the willingness was very high, and that among the below 60 years old participants the willingness was significantly higher when the protection of others was the reason for restrictions. **Thus, communication should focus on the protection of others to gain the highest levels of acceptance.** | |
| - The survey also assessed whether participants had avoided people from countries with outbreaks of COVID-19. The study found that participants had shown such behaviour where they assessed COVID-19 as a severe disease, didn’t trust the authorities and felt that the virus was ‘close to them’. **This suggests that communication measures to address stigma should be led by the most trusted source of information.** | |

| **Practices; migrants; global** | 
|---|---|
| - Outbreaks create fear, and fear is a key ingredient for racism and xenophobia to thrive. | **Racism and discrimination in COVID-19 responses** |
| - The COVID-19 pandemic has uncovered social and political fractures within communities, with racialized and discriminatory responses to fear, disproportionately affecting marginalised groups. | |
| - **Globally this research finds that migrants, particularly those without documents, avoid hospitals for fear of identification and reporting, ultimately presenting late with potentially more advanced disease.** | |
| Practices; guidance                                                                 | - There is no vaccine against COVID-19 so far, case fatality rates are still uncertain. Psychologically, this means high uncertainty regarding the likelihood of catching the disease, its potential severity and ability to take control over the process by preventive measure. - These perceptions are thus likely to be updated based on changes in epidemiology, media reports, information and misinformation. | WHO Monitoring knowledge, risk perceptions, preventive behaviours and trust to inform pandemic outbreak response |
| #LIVELIHOODS                                                                        | Cost of living, Labour costs, Consumer spending habits - As governments introduced strict measures to slow the spread of COVID-19, shoppers rushed to stockpile ahead of a complete lockdown. - The paper finds that even those who are confident that supply chains would cope with increased demand, as they see that people keep buying large quantities and stocks start to deplete, they may worry that others have more information than they have. This may lead them to disregard their own information and therefore starting to stockpile. **This highlights that the public has a great behavioural influence on each other.** | COVID-19 Economic Research University of Cambridge |
| #CREATIVE                                                                          | resilience, creative, drama - The TV series Treme, which started in 2010, five years after Hurricane Katrina, offers an interesting engagement example of how large devastating events can be explored to help individuals and communities to cope, recover and continue to thrive. - The series explores a diverse set of issues which affected the New Orleans community after the infamous disaster. - The limitations by which traditional and emerging media operates translated into a perhaps limited understanding of how the residents of New Orleans and surrounding areas were affected. | https://www.hbo.com/treme |
| resilience, creative, graphic novel | - This highlights how drama can explore many topics that have not been well understood or investigated in media coverage following a disaster.  
- The importance of Josh Neufeld’s ‘New Orleans After The Deluge’ lies largely in the experience of the author who volunteered for The American Red Cross during the response and recovery period to Hurricane Katrina.  
- Neufeld’s graphic novel was praised for its raw emotion of the disaster event.  
- **This highlights how graphic novels can reveal different information, events and situations that rarely attract the attention of mainstream media, allowing communities to explore large devastating events.** | https://www.consuringkatrina.com/ more |