

COVID-19 Analysis

KNOWLEDGE / ATTITUDES / PRACTICES / PARTICIPATION

Risk Communication, Community Engagement and Accountability (CEA) recommendations based on an interdisciplinary review of literature related to COVID-19. This includes a scan of literature from the fields of social science, design, futures and other research fields with a focus on literature on Asia Pacific.

To share feedback, or to contribute, email Caroline Austin, IFRC Asia Pacific Community Engagement Team on RRCEA.AP@ifrc.org

Update #3: 03/06/2020		
Themes	Key Learnings	Source
#STIGMA		
Stigma, HIV, SARS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article shows that both the fear of people who are different and the fear of disease can lead to stigmatization and may play out as stigma or scapegoating as an epidemic or pandemic emerges. - This suggests the importance of understanding in programme response: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - how different social groups are characterised and the historical context to these groups; and - Identifying and monitoring power dynamics between social groups that may lead to stigmatisation. 	Don C. Des Jarlais, Sandro Galea, Melissa Tracy, Susan Tross, and David Vlahov, 2006: Stigmatization of Newly Emerging Infectious Diseases: AIDS and SARS American Journal of Public Health

		<p>96, 561-567. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2004.054742</p>
<p>COVID-19, stigma, HIV</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines that the convergence of framing COVID-19 as a “foreign virus” and an “infodemic” has ignited fear and stigma. - It reports that stigma experiences are shaped by intersecting social identities such as gender and age. Understanding the specific contexts of COVID-19 stigma can inform tailored mitigation strategies. - Finally, it provides examples of stigma interventions used in addressing HIV stigma that exposed and eliminated racism and xenophobia experienced by persons blamed for HIV. These include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Initiatives that encourage sharing on how stigma affects communities and encouraging reflection on personal biases and ensuring institutional support for stigma mitigation. - Participatory learning through engagement activities that use approaches such as discussions, games and role-play. 	<p>Logie, C. (2020). Lessons learned from HIV can inform our approach to COVID-19 stigma. <i>Journal of the International AIDS Society</i>, 23(5), e25504. https://doi.org/10.1002/jia2.25504</p>
<p>COVID-19, coronavirus, Twitter, stigma, social media, public health</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This study investigates how referencing COVID-19 as the “Chinese virus” or “China virus” has the potential to create and perpetuate stigma, especially online. - It finds that the rise in tweets referencing “Chinese virus” or “China virus,” along with the content of these tweets from March 2020, indicates that knowledge translation, including information generation, filtering, and amplification, may be occurring online and COVID-19 stigma is likely being perpetrated on Twitter in some contexts. - This suggests that the language used is important. Attaching locations or ethnicity to the COVID-19 virus may perpetuate existing negative stereotypes and assumptions and fuel stigmatizing attitudes. 	<p>Budhwani, H., & Sun, R. (2020). Creating COVID-19 Stigma by Referencing the Novel Coronavirus as the “Chinese virus” on Twitter: Quantitative</p>

		<p><u>Analysis of Social Media Data.</u> <i>Journal of Medical Internet Research, 22(5).</i> e19301. https://doi.org/10.2196/19301</p>
<p>COVID-19, stigma, HIV</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This guide suggests that the use of inclusive language and less stigmatizing terminology helped to control stigma related to HIV. - It demonstrates that words matter and considering the use of appropriate language has the power to strengthen the response to epidemics, as language shapes beliefs and may influence behaviours. 	<p><u>UNAIDS Terminology Guidelines, October 2011</u></p>
<p>COVID-19, stigma, humanitarian settings.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines lessons learned from previous epidemics that are applicable to COVID-19. - These include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - that stigmatizing viral transmission further places populations at risk and reduces access to care because this drives people to hide illness to avoid discrimination and prevent them from seeking health care or adopting preventative practices. 	<p><u>Lau, L.S., Samari, G., Moresky, R.T. et al. COVID-19 in humanitarian settings and lessons learned from past epidemics. <i>Nat Med</i> 26, 647–648 (2020).</u> https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-020-0851-2</p>

<p>COVID-19, stigma, HIV</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines how historical and current approaches to illness—including HIV—can inform COVID-19 stigma reduction. Approaches suggested include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stigma-reduction information should carefully reflect the evolving patterns of COVID-19 risk to foster empathy while simultaneously transforming physical distancing into a normal and sustained practice until the pandemic is over; and - Empowering and strengthening communities to support persons to protect their own and one other’s health; and - Stigma interventions should address both factors which cause stigma (knowledge, misinformation) and facilitators (health policies, institutional practices) to be effective. 	<p><u>Logie CH, Turan JM. How Do We Balance Tensions Between COVID-19 Public Health Responses and Stigma Mitigation? Learning from HIV Research [published online ahead of print, 2020 Apr 7]. <i>AIDS Behav.</i> 2020;1-4. doi:10.1007/s10461-020-02856-8</u></p>
------------------------------	--	--

Update #2: 12/05/2020

Themes	Key Learnings	Source
<p>#RELIGION</p> <p>Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article illustrates that previous health crises such as HIV and AIDS were not just health crises, but had social and moral elements such as uncertainty, fear and blame as well. - Given these social and moral elements, this article outlines that religious leaders can be powerful agents of change, with their enormous influence in reducing stigma and discrimination. 	<p><u>HEALTH-ASIA: Religious Leaders Tackle HIV, AIDS, Lim. Jaime.IPS - Inter Press Service: Montevideo, Jan 2008.</u></p>
<p>COVID-19; mass gatherings; religion</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines that mass gathering management and cancellations require clear communication and responsive political approaches. - Decisions to cancel mass religious gatherings are viewed as difficult and unpopular but are made to safeguard not only the mass gathering but also the wider global community. - Emphasising the benefits to the wider community is thought to be effective in communicating mass gathering cancellations. 	<p><u>The cancellation of mass gatherings (MGs)? Decision making in the time of COVID-19, Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease. Available online 14 March 2020.</u></p>

<p>Religion; stigma; Ebola</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines the impact of quarantine from previous outbreaks, including the Ebola epidemic in Liberia. - For some minority groups the impact of quarantine in the Ebola epidemic led to stigma, which potentially led participants in this study to keep easily treatable, non-Ebola illnesses a secret and avoid seeking help. - Therefore, it finds that education about the disease and clear communication on the rationale for quarantine and public health information provided to the general public can be beneficial to reduce stigma. They suggest that more detailed information targeted at schools and workplaces might also be useful. 	<p><u>The psychological impact of quarantine and how to reduce it: rapid review of the evidence</u> <i>The Lancet</i>, Vol. 395, No. 10227, p912–920, February 2020.</p>
<p>Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article sets out how religious beliefs and practices shape (positively and negatively) ways of caring for the sick, patterns of stigma, and gender roles. - For example, Ebola's close association with cultural and religious practices makes active community engagement especially important as change of funeral practices was imperative to reversing the epidemic and religious leaders (modern and traditional, Muslim and Christian) have to be involved. - It further illustrates that the religious dimensions of behaviour change, for example on burials, and highlights the value of religious community expertise and the need to draw on it more purposefully and systematically in community engagement. 	<p><u>Religion and Ebola: learning from experience</u>, <i>The Lancet</i>, 2015.</p>
<p>Religious leaders; spiritual leaders; importance to risk communications</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article outlines what can be learnt from recent outbreaks to strengthen risk communication capacity for the next influenza pandemic in the Western Pacific Region. - A lesson learned from the SARS outbreak in Fiji in 2016 showed that religious leaders, women's groups and youth networks have a place in effective risk communication in engaging vulnerable groups, particularly pregnant women, encouraging vaccination and adoption of protective behaviours. 	<p><u>Learning from recent outbreaks to strengthen risk communication capacity for the next influenza pandemic in the</u></p>

		<u>Western Pacific Region, February 2019.</u>
Behaviour; collective action; collective societies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article considers how to motivate preventative actions through public health messaging. - It considers the benefits of communicating prevention messaging to individuals, society, or both. - It finds that putting greater emphasis on self-identity ('Don't be a spreader') inhibit high-risk behaviours related to infection control better than those using less ('Don't spread') - Therefore, emphasising the public benefit within public health messaging is more effective in motivating preventative actions. 	<u>Warning "Don't spread" vs. "Don't be a spreader" to prevent the COVID-19 pandemic, May 2020.</u>
Collective action; strong group identity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This rapid, narrative review summarizes useful evidence from behavioural science for fighting the COVID-19 outbreak. It outlines that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Public-spirited behaviour is more likely when a strategy that is "best for all" is clearly articulated and repeated. - Stronger group identity - nationally, locally, within organizations - enhances collective action. - Reasonable punishment of noncompliance, including social disapproval, is helpful in adopting health behaviours. 	<u>Lunn, P. D., Belton, C. A., Lavin, C., McGowan, F. P., Timmons, S., & Robertson, D. A. (2020). Using Behavioral Science to help fight the Coronavirus. <i>Journal of Behavioral Public Administration</i>, 3(1).</u>

Update #1: 28/04/2020

Themes	Key Learnings	Source
<p>#SOCIAL</p> <p>Population perception; social media</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This article uncovers the specific types of risks and multiple dimensions of these risk perceptions of the public. The article also shares the solutions proposed by the public to deal with the risk during the Zika virus crisis on the social media platform Reddit. - It demonstrates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - That social media can be utilized in bottom-up efforts to articulate risks and risk management measures. - In health crises of high uncertainty, average citizens rely on themselves to develop plausible explanations about the public health crisis. This highlights the importance of ordinary citizens as risk communicators. - It highlights opportunities of participatory risk communication, where the public can be engaged as risk communicators so that public health authorities can solicit public views, understand public interest and concerns, the rationality and values behind the public’s risk perception, and investigate issues that they may have overlooked (e.g. experiential and local knowledge). - Finally, ordinary citizens think beyond the personal scope of risk. Thus, it is important to address the public’s interest in understanding, identifying, and being informed about risks beyond the personal scope of health messaging. 	<p>https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3173574.3173788</p>

Population perception; quarantine.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This research, published in Lancet, into the psychological impact of quarantine shows that providing a clear rationale in communications for the isolation measures can protect mental health and well being. 	<u>The psychological impact of quarantine and how to reduce it: rapid review of the evidence</u>
Cognition; health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This research highlights that recalling complex information can be more difficult during times when resources and attention is stretched thinly therefore it is important to focus on communicating the most important information. 	<u>Poverty Impedes Cognitive Function</u>
Population perception; health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - People more concerned for those vulnerable to COVID-19 than for their own health, poll shows. - A silver lining: The majority believe pandemic will bring them closer to family and friends. - This highlights it is key to share what the public can do in order to protect the most vulnerable. 	<u>IPOS Poll</u>
Physical/social distancing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In this new working paper, Flavio Toxvaerd revisits one of the most pressing issues of the day - social distancing. - Taking an economist's perspective to this issue, he asks how and when spontaneous social distancing may be expected to occur and what drives people's efforts to protect themselves against infection. - This highlights that even without any government intervention or legislation, spontaneous and non-coordinated social distancing will eventually occur. 	<u>COVID-19 Economic Research University of Cambridge</u>
Accessible channels; risk communications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Evidence shows that the public can make informed choices, protect themselves, and comply with recommended practices if they perceive measures of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consistency, competence, fairness, objectivity, empathy, or sincerity in crisis response; - communicated through trusted and accessible channels; and 	<u>Monitoring behavioural insights related to COVID-19 and</u>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - when the necessary services are available. 	supplementary material
Risk communications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This Lancet article summarises and publishes outcomes from the Weekly COVID -19 Snapshot Monitoring (COSMO) tool initiated in Germany. - It reports that two lines of communication dominated in the media in week 11: (i) the outbreak needs to be slowed down to prevent overburdening of the health system (e.g., #flatteningthecurve on Twitter) and (ii) to protect those who are very vulnerable. - The second wave of the survey asked whether participants would be willing to restrict themselves in their everyday lives given these two different explanations (within subject). The analysis showed that in general the willingness was very high, and that among the below 60 years old participants the willingness was significantly higher when the protection of others was the reason for restrictions. Thus, communication should focus on the protection of others to gain the highest levels of acceptance. - The survey also assessed whether participants had avoided people from countries with outbreaks of COVID-19. The study found that participants had shown such behaviour where they assessed COVID-19 as a severe disease, didn't trust the authorities and felt that the virus was 'close to them'. This suggests that communication measures to address stigma should be led by the most trusted source of information. 	Monitoring behavioural insights related to COVID-19 and supplementary material
Practices; migrants; global	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Outbreaks create fear, and fear is a key ingredient for racism and xenophobia to thrive. - The COVID-19 pandemic has uncovered social and political fractures within communities, with racialized and discriminatory responses to fear, disproportionately affecting marginalised groups. - Globally this research finds that migrants, particularly those without documents, avoid hospitals for fear of identification and reporting, ultimately presenting late with potentially more advanced disease. 	Racism and discrimination in COVID-19 responses

Practices; guidance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is no vaccine against COVID-19 so far, case fatality rates are still uncertain. Psychologically, this means high uncertainty regarding the likelihood of catching the disease, its potential severity and ability to take control over the process by preventive measure. - These perceptions are thus likely to be updated based on changes in epidemiology, media reports, information and misinformation. 	<u>WHO Monitoring knowledge, risk perceptions, preventive behaviours and trust to inform pandemic outbreak response</u>
#LIVELIHOODS		
Cost of living, Labour costs, Consumer spending habits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As governments introduced strict measures to slow the spread of COVID-19, shoppers rushed to stockpile ahead of a complete lockdown. - The paper finds that even those who are confident that supply chains would cope with increased demand, as they see that people keep buying large quantities and stocks start to deplete, they may worry that others have more information than they have. This may lead them to disregard their own information and therefore starting to stockpile. This highlights that the public has a great behavioural influence on each other. 	<u>COVID-19 Economic Research University of Cambridge</u>
#CREATIVE		
resilience, creative, drama	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The TV series Treme, which started in 2010, five years after Hurricane Katrina, offers an interesting engagement example of how large devastating events can be explored to help individuals and communities to cope, recover and continue to thrive. - The series explores a diverse set of issues which affected the New Orleans community after the infamous disaster. - The limitations by which traditional and emerging media operates translated into a perhaps limited understanding of how the residents of New Orleans and surrounding areas were affected. 	<u>https://www.hbo.com/treme</u>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This highlights how drama can explore many topics that have not been well understood or investigated in media coverage following a disaster. 	
<p>resilience, creative, graphic novel</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The importance of Josh Neufeld’s ‘New Orleans After The Deluge’ lies largely in the experience of the author who volunteered for The American Red Cross during the response and recovery period to Hurricane Katrina. - Neufeld’s graphic novel was praised for its raw emotion of the disaster event. - This highlights how graphic novels can reveal different information, events and situations that rarely attract the attention of mainstream media, allowing communities to explore large devastating events. 	<p>https://www.consultingkatrina.com/more</p>